

**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday,  
23rd July 2003 at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of Michael Nelson de la Haye Esquire,  
Greffier of the States.**

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Air Chief Marshal Sir John Cheshire, K.B.E., C.B.,  
was present**

All members were present with the exception of –

Senator Leonard Norman – out of the Island  
Francis Herbert Amy, Connétable of Grouville – ill  
John Germain Baudains, Connétable of St. Martin– out of the Island  
Geoffrey William Fisher, Connétable of St. Lawrence– out of the Island  
David Leon Crespel, Deputy of Trinity – out of the Island  
Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains, Deputy of St. Clement– out of the Island.

Prayers

**Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited: dissolution – P.33/2003**

THE STATES, resumed consideration of a proposition of Senator Stuart Syvret regarding the Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited: dissolution.

Senator Christopher Gerard Pellow Lakeman, having declared an interest in the matter, withdrew from the Chamber during consideration of this item.

Deputy P.J.D. Ryan of St. Helier, having declared an interest in the matter at the commencement of the debate of this item the previous day, remained absent during its consideration.

THE STATES rejected paragraph (a) of the proposition of Senator Stuart Syvret requesting them –

- (a) to agree, in principle, that the Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited should be wound up as soon as practicable, and that revised arrangements for dealing with the management and development of the areas currently under the administration of the Company, that better meet the needs of the community, be put in place, following a public consultation process and consultation between all relevant Committees of the States;

Members present voted as follows –

**“Pour” (6)**

**Senators**

Syvret, Le Claire, E. Vibert.

**Deputies**

Bridge(H), Southern(H), Grouville.

**“Contre” (39)**

**Senators**

Le Maistre, Walker, Kinnard, Le Sueur, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf.

**Connétables**

St. Ouen, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Mary, St. John, St. Peter, St. Clement, St. Helier, Trinity.

**Deputies**

Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), Huet(H), St. Martin, St. John, Le Main(H), Dubras(L), Dorey(H), Troy(B), Voisin(L), Scott Warren(S), Farnham(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H), Martin(H), Bernstein(B), Ferguson(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Taylor(C), St. Peter, Hilton(H), De Faye(H).

THE STATES rejected paragraphs (c) and (d) of the proposition of Senator Stuart Syvret requesting them –

- (c) to agree that it was the view of the Assembly that the present proposals chosen by the Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited for the development of the Island Site should be abandoned and to request the Policy and Resources Committee to direct the Directors, in accordance with the provisions of Article 22 (a) of the Articles of Association of the Company, to abandon those plans;
- (d) to agree that the development of the Island Site should be reconsidered by all relevant Committees of the States and that public consultation should take place, to ensure that the project meets the best needs of the community before revised proposals are brought forward to the States for approval by the relevant sponsoring committee.

Members present voted as follows –

**“Pour” (14)**

**Senators**

Le Maistre, Syvret, Le Claire, E. Vibert.

**Connétable**

St. Mary.

**Deputies**

Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), St. Martin, Fox(H), Bridge(H), Martin(H), Southern(H), Grouville, De Faye(H).

**“Contre” (31)**

**Senators**

Walker, Kinnard, Le Sueur, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf.

**Connétables**

St. Ouen, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. John, St. Peter, St. Clement, St. Helier, Trinity.

**Deputies**

Huet(H), St. John, Le Main(H), Dubras(L), Dorey(H), Troy(B), Voisin(L), Scott Warren(S), Farnham(S), Le Hérissier(S), Bernstein(B), Ferguson(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Taylor(C), St. Peter, Hilton(H).

## **Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited: re-appointment of members – P.103/2003**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Policy and Resources Committee –

- (a) appointed for a period of 3 years expiring on 20th August 2006, the following collectively as non-States Directors of the Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited –

Jurat John Claude Tibbo;  
Mr. Peter Joseph Crespel

and appointed Jurat John Claude Tibbo as Chairman of the Board for a period of up to 3 months;  
and

- (b) instructed the Greffier of the States to notify the company of the States' decision.

## **Change of Presidency**

The Greffier of the States retired from the Chair during the consideration of the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee concerning Machinery of Government: establishment of Scrutiny Panels and a Public Accounts Committee and the meeting resumed after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff, Mr. Michael Cameron St. John Birt.

## **Machinery of Government: Establishment of Scrutiny Panels and Public Accounts Committee – P.79/2003 Comments and Amendments**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee regarding Machinery of Government: Establishment of Scrutiny Panels and Public Accounts Committee and rejected an amendment of Deputy Jeremy Laurence Dorey of St. Helier that in paragraph (a), there be deleted the list of proposed areas of responsibility, and there be substituted –

- “(i) Corporate Services, Policies and External Relations;  
(ii) Internal Policy 1;  
(iii) Internal Policy 2;  
(iv) Draft legislation.”

Members present voted as follows –

**“Pour” (11)**

**Connétable**

St. Peter.

**Deputies**

Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), Huet(H), St. John, Dorey(H), Southern(H), Ferguson(B), Taylor(C), Grouville De Faye(H).

**“Contre” (33)**

**Senators**

Le Maistre, Syvret, Walker, Kinnard, Le Sueur, Lakeman, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf, E. Vibert.

**Connétables**

St. Ouen, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Mary, St. John, St. Clement, St. Helier, Trinity.

**Deputies**

St. Martin, Dubras(L), Troy(B), Scott Warren(S), Farnham(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H), Bridge(H Martin(H), Bernstein(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Ryan(H), St. Peter, Hilton(H).

THE STATES rejected amendments of Deputy Jeremy Laurence Dorey of St. Helier that–

(2) in sub-paragraph (b)(i), for the words “Chairmen’s Committee” there be substituted the words “Public Accounts Committee”;

(4) in sub-paragraph (b)(vii) delete the words “through the Chairmen’s Committee” be deleted;

(8) paragraph (h) be deleted and substituted by the following paragraph–

“(h) to agree –

- (i) that the Public Accounts Committee shall act as a co-ordinating body for the work of the Scrutiny Panels;
- (ii) that the Privileges and Procedures Committee shall oversee the prioritisation and allocation of resources to the Public Accounts Committee and Scrutiny Panels;
- (iii) that the Public Accounts Committee shall report to the States on the operation of the scrutiny function, making recommendations for change as appropriate and in particular, no later than 12 months after the establishment of the Scrutiny Panels, making recommendations on the desirability or otherwise of introducing a mechanism to enable the ‘call-in’ of Executive decisions.”

Members present voted as follows –

**“Pour” (10)**

**Connétable**

Trinity.

**Deputies**

Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), Huet(H), St. John, Dorey(H), Troy(B), Southern(H), Ferguson(B), De Faye(H).

**“Contre” (32)**

**Senators**

Le Maistre, Syvret, Walker, Kinnard, Le Sueur, Lakeman, Routier, Ozouf, E. Vibert.

**Connétables**

St. Ouen, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Mary, St. John, St. Clement, St. Helier.

**Deputies**

St. Martin, Dubras(L), Scott Warren(S), Farnham(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H), Bridge(H), Martin(H) Bernstein(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Ryan(H), Taylor(C), Grouville, St. Peter, Hilton(H).

THE STATES granted leave to Deputy Jeremy Laurence Dorey of St. Helier to withdraw his amendment that in sub-paragraph (b)(ii), there be deleted the words“existing and proposed”.

THE STATES commenced consideration of amendments of Senator Stuart Syvret that –

(1) After paragraph (b)(iv) there be inserted the following sub-paragraph –

(v) to call in decisions of the Executive and review such decisions, and report thereon to the States and Executive;

subsequent sub-paragraphs of paragraph (b) be renumbered accordingly.

(2) In paragraph (h)(iii) there be deleted the words ‘and, in particular, no later than 12 months after the establishment of the Scrutiny Panels, to make recommendations on the desirability or otherwise of introducing a mechanism to enable the ‘call-in’ of Executive decisions’.

THE STATES then adjourned, having agreed to continue consideration of the amendments of Senator Syvret and the outstanding items of public business on Thursday 24th July 2003.

THE STATES rose at 5.35 p.m.

**A.H. HARRIS**

*Deputy Greffier of the States.*

Re-issue note

This set of Minutes has been re-issued as the original set issued omitted reference to the decision of the States on P.103/2003 and gave incorrect information about the Change of Presidency.